# University of Notre Dame War and Statecraft in the Catholic Intellectual Tradition

Instructor: Michael C. Desch Office: Jenkins Nanovic 2026 Office Hours: and by appointment.

Contact: 1-2792, (574) 302-6024, or mdesch@nd.edu

The position of the Roman Catholic Church on war is complex: On the one hand, *The Catechism of the Catholic Church* seems to enjoin fairly strict pacifism: "2307 The fifth commandment forbids the intentional destruction of human life. Because of the evils and injustices that accompany all war, the Church insistently urges everyone to prayer and to action so that the divine Goodness may free us from the ancient bondage of war." On the other hand, it also has a long tradition of sanctioning "just war:" "2308, 'as long as the danger of war persists and there is no international authority with the necessary competence and power, governments cannot be denied the right of lawful self-defense, once all peace efforts have failed." (http://www.scborromeo.org/ccc/p3s2c2a5.htm#III)

The University of Notre Dame's Mission Statement avers that our "distinctive goal is to provide a forum where the various lines of Catholic thought intersect with all the forms of knowledge and creativity found in the university." This course seeks to bring into conversation the Roman Catholic Intellectual Tradition and contemporary international relations and international security affairs from the discipline of Political Science to introduce students to their complex interactions and marked inconsistencies.

Learning Goals: This course seeks to not only present substantively and morally interesting important materials but also do so in a way that meets Notre Dame's new Core Curricula requirement for "Catholicism Across the Disciplines" (CAD). Through readings, class discussion, and take-home written exercises, it aims to introduce Notre Dame students to the scriptural origins and evolution of the rich, yet complex, legacy of Catholic thought on war and statecraft. It also seeks to critically engage the Catholic Intellectual Tradition with modern thought about war and peace, particularly from a political science perspective.

Specific learning goals include helping students explore faith questions or normative questions critically as they simultaneously explore Catholic content from the perspective of international relations and the Catholic Intellectual Tradition. It also will empower students intellectually to engage both perspectives with equal facility. Indeed, the core approach of the course will be to foster "critical and constructive engagement" engagement from both a disciplinary political science approach as well as through the Catholic Intellectual Tradition. Its objective is to foster a deeper understanding of both the students' faith tradition as well as modern secular thinking on this topic. At the end of the course, students should have a richer understanding of international relations, particularly its ethical and normative elements.

Attendance: Students must attend every class and do all of the reading. While attendance will <u>not</u> be taken in class, we will cover material beyond the readings. In other words, if you want to do well in this class, do all of the readings and attend every class!

**Grading:** Your grade will be based on four things:

Discussion = 20%
Take Home Memo #1 = 20%
Take Home Memo #2 = 20%
Final Paper = 40%

**Discussion**: Participation in discussion is mandatory, indeed I have found that there is generally a "positive correlation" between participation and the level of the student's grade. There are two elements of the discussion grade: First, every student is required to post a discussion question on the course's Concourse site (https://concourse.nd.edu/webct/logon/244340249011) no later than 6 PM the night before class. Second, students should come to class having reviewed all of the class's thought questions and prepared to discuss them.

**Five page memoranda**: I generally assign 2-3 questions of which students can pick one to answer. The answers must be typed, double-spaced, and notes formatted according to Kate L. Turabian, et al., <u>A Manual for Writers of Term Papers, Theses, and Dissertations</u> (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2007).

**20 page final paper:** The final paper for this class will be a 15 page essay. Students will use the analytical tools and historical materials covered in this class to defend the Church's position on some aspect of war and statecraft (selected in consultation with the instructor) on moral or theological grounds or to critique it on the same grounds.

#### **Grading criteria:**

- A: B + creative interpretation of fact or novel approach to problem.
- B: Basic grasp of facts and interpretation.
- C: Minor errors of facts and/or interpretation.
- D: Major errors of facts and/or interpretation.
- F: Failure to turn in assignment/academic dishonesty.

Policies on attendance, tardiness, missed/assignments, and classroom conduct: Students are expected to attend all classes, save in the case of illness, family emergency, or university-excused absence. Late/missed assignments without a valid excuse will not be accepted. Students are expected to arrive in time for class as late arrivals are disruptive. Finally, students are expected to comport themselves at all times in class with the utmost professionalism as becomes a Notre Dame man or woman.

Academic Integrity: All students must abide by the Notre Dame Honor Code: "As a member of the Notre Dame community, I will not participate in or tolerate academic dishonesty." Details are available at http://www.nd.edu/~hnrcode/docs/index.htm. Please note that academic dishonesty (including plagiarism and unauthorized multiple submissions of work for assignments) will not be tolerated and will be punished severely. If I suspect academic dishonesty, I will use Turnitin.com to determine whether the student's work is original or not.

**Students with Disabilities:** I am strongly committed to working with students who have any disability recognized under the Americans with Disabilities Act to ensure that they are able to fully participate in class activities. If you feel you require a "reasonable accommodation," please follow the process through http://www.nd.edu/~osd/.

Computer policy: There is growing concern among my faculty colleagues that some students are using their lap-top computers during class for non-class activities (e.g., email or web-surfing unrelated to the class). This detracts from the class discussion and the students' learning experience more generally. I am reluctant to ban lap-tops from class entirely as some students find them much easier to use to take notes, store their readings electronically, or use the web to find information that enhances their participation in class. Therefore, if you want to use a laptop in my class, you must send me a formal memorandum pledging to use your lap-top strictly for class purposes. Violations of this agreement will be treated as violations of the Honor Code.

We will be using the following books available though either Amazon.com or the University Bookstore:

John Vidmar, OP, The Catholic Church Through the Ages: A History (New York: Paulist, 2005). Rodney Stark, God's Battalions: The Case for the Crusades (New York HarperOne, 2009). Robert John Araujo, SJ and John A. Lucal, SJ, Papal Diplomacy and the Quest for Peace: The Vatican and International Organizations from the Early Years to the League of Nations (Naples, FL: Sapentia, 2004). John Cornwell, Hitler's Pope: The Secret History of Pius XII (New York: Penguin, 2008). George Weigel, Witness to Hope: The Biography of Pope John Paul, II (New York: HarperCollins, 1999).

In addition, other readings will be available electronically such as "\*" through the Notre Dame Library at <a href="http://www.library.nd.edu/find\_journals/ejournals.php">http://www.library.nd.edu/find\_journals/ejournals.php</a>.

Items marked "@" will be available through electronic course reserve at https://www.library.nd.edu/eresources/ereserves//course.cgi?course=2010F POLS 13181 03

Some readings are available on-line for no charge and their web address is provided with the citation.

Finally, for some of the classes, I have included suggested movies you might watch to enrich your understanding of the topic.

The basic schedule and outline of the course is as follows:

8/24/10: Introduction – Secular International Relations Theory and Catholic Social Teaching on War and Statecraft (Philpott?).

- Daniel Philpott, "One Professor's Guide to Studying International Relations and Peace Studies From a Catholic Perspective," (Unpublished ms., University of Notre Dame, n.d.).@
- Araujo and Lucal, chap. 1.

8/26/10: Holy Scripture and War: The Old Testament and Holy War for the Chosen People.

- The New Catholic Bible (available at http://www.usccb.org/nab/bible/index.shtml), Genesis, Chapter 11 (verses 1-9), Chapter 17 (verses 4-8), and Chapter 22 (verses 15-24).
- Deuteronomy, Chapters 7 and 20.
- Vidmar, pp. 1-8.

\_

8/31/10: Holy Scripture and War: A Different Old Testament? (The Ten Commandments)

- Exodus, Chapters 1-14.
- Isias, Chapters 65-66.

9/2/10: No Class/APSA Convention.

9/7/10: Holy Scripture and War: The Gospel Roots of Pacifism? (*The Passion of the Christ*)

- Matthew, Chapter 4 (verses 8-10); 5 (verses 1-12 and 38-48); 8 (verses 5-13); 22 (verses 15-22); and 26 (verses 47-56).
- Gospel of St. John, Chapter 10.
- Vidmar, pp. 9-35.

9/9/10: Holy Scripture and War: The Early Church and the Roots of Christian Universalism.

- Acts of the Apostles, II, Chapters 10 (verses 34-43) and 11.
- Romans, Chapter 1 (verses 18-32), 3, 4, and 9.
- Vidmar, 36-63

9/14/10: The Origins of Just War Theory, I.

- St. Augustine, "From *On Free Choice of the Will*, Book I," "From Book 22," "Letter 153," "Letter 93," and "Letter 189," in Oliver O'Donovan and Joan Lockwood O'Donovan, eds, From Irenaeus to Grotius: A Sourcebook in Christian Political Thought (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1999), 113-14, 117-19, 119-31, 131-33 and 133-36. [Hereafter OD]@
- Vidmar, 64-87.

9/16/10: The Evolution of Just War Theory, II.

- St. Thomas Aquinas. <u>Summa Theologica</u>, Part 2 of the Second Part. Questions 40 and 41, "Of War" and "Of Strife". trans. Fathers of the English Dominican Province. Great Books of the Western World, Vol. 20. Robert Maynard Hutchins ed. (Encyclopedia Britannica Inc., Chicago: 1952), pp. 577-583@
- Vidmar, 132-64.
- The Challenge of Peace: God's Promise and Our Response A Pastoral Letter on War and Peace by the National Conference of Catholic Bishops (May 3, 1983), paras. 5 121 at <a href="http://www.usccb.org/sdwp/international/TheChallengeofPeace.pdf">http://www.usccb.org/sdwp/international/TheChallengeofPeace.pdf</a>.

9/21/19: The Rise of Christendom and the Temporal Power of the Church.

- "Donation of Constantine" in OD, 228-30.@

- John G. Ruggie, "Territoriality and Beyond: Problematizing Modernity in International Relations," *International Organization* Vol. 47, No. 1 (Winter 1993): 139-74.\*
- Vidmar, 96-118.

-

#### First Memorandum Assigned, Due 9/28/10 at 5:00 PM (e.s.t.) Via Concourse.

9/23/10: Christendom Wasn't All It Was Cracked Up to Be.

- Markus Fischer, "Feudal Europe, 800-1300: Communal Discourse and Conflictual Practices," *International Organization* Vol. 46, No. 2 (Spring 1992): 427-66.\*
- Rodney Bruce Hall and Friedrich V. Kratochwil, "Medieval Tales: Neorealist 'Science" and the Abuse of History," *International Organization* Vol. 47, No. 3 (Summer 1993): 479-91.\*
- Fischer, "On Context, Facts, and Norms: Response to Hall and Kratochwil," *International Organization* Vol. 47, No. 3 (Summer 1993): 480-500.\*

9/28/10: Just/Holy War Theory in Practice: The Crusades, I (El Cid).

- Stark, Introduction-Chapter 5.
- Vidmar, 88-95 and 119-131.

9/30/10: Just/Holy War Theory in Practice: The Crusades, II (*The Kingdom of Heaven*).

- Stark, Chapter 6-Conclusion.

10/5/10: Just/Holy War Theory in Practice: Colonialism and the Missions. (The Mission).

- Bartolome de las Casas, A Brief Account of the Destruction of the Indies Or, a faithful NARRATIVE OF THE Horrid and Unexampled Massacres, Butcheries, and all manner of Cruelties, that Hell and Malice could invent, committed by the Popish Spanish Party on the inhabitants of West-India, TOGETHER With the Devastations of several Kingdoms in America by Fire and Sword, for the space of Forty and Two Years, from the time of its first Discovery by them. (Project Gutenberg, January 9, 2007) at <a href="http://www.gutenberg.org/cache/epub/20321/pg20321.html">http://www.gutenberg.org/cache/epub/20321/pg20321.html</a>
- Francisco de Vitoria, "From The American Indians," in OD 613-30.@
- Vidmar, 241-51 and 307-09.

10/7/10: The Renaissance and Catholic International Thought (The Agony and the Ecstasy).

- Thomas More, "From Utopia, Book I," and "From Utopia, Book II," in OD, 559-69.@
- Desiderius Erasmus, "From The Complaint of Peace," 572-80. OD
- Francisco Suarez, "From Laws and God the Lawgiver, Book II" and "The Three Theological Virtues, Faith, Hope, and Charity: On Charity, Disputation 13, War" in OD, 727-32 and 736-42@
- Araujo and Lucal, chap. 2.

10/12/10: The Reformation and the End of Christendom (A Man for All Seasons).

- Otto Hintze, "Calvinism and Raison d'Etat in Early Seventeenth Century Brandenburg" in Felix Gilbert, ed., The Historical Essays of Otto Hintze (New York: Oxford University Press, 1975), 88-154.@
- Daniel Philpott, "The Religious Roots of Modern International Relations," *World Politics* Vol. 52, No. 2 (January 2000): 206-45.\*
- Vidmar, 165-240.

10/14/10: Catholicism Confronts the French Revolution and the Rise of Liberalism.

- Joseph De Maistre, "Reflections on Protestantism in its Relations to Sovereignty" in Christopher Olaf Blum, ed., *Critics of the Enlightenment* (Wilmington, Delaware: ISI Books, 2004): 133-56.
- Juan Donoso Cortes, "Discourse on Dictatorship" and "Discourse on the General Situation in Europe" in R.A. Herrera, ed., *Donoso Cortes: Readings in Political Theory* ( Ave Maria, FL: Sapientia Press, 2007), 51-67 and 68-82,
- Vidmar, 258-88.

#### Fall Break, No Class 10/19 and 10/21

10/26/10: Catholicism in the Age of Total War, I.

- Araujo and Lucal, chaps. 3-5.

10/28/10: Catholicism in the Age of Total War, II.

- Araujo and Lucal, chaps. 6-9.
- Vidmar, pp. 310-33.

11/2/10: Catholicism in the Age of Total War, VI: Was Pius XII Hitler's Pope?. (Amen)

- Daniel Jonah Goldhagen, "What Would Jesus Have Done?" *The New Republic* vol. 226, No. 2 (2002): 21-45.@
- Ronald Rychlak, "Goldhagen V. Pius XII," at http://www.catholiceducation.org/articles/facts/fm0015.html
- Commission for Religious Relations With the Jews, We Remember: A Reflection on the Shoah (March 16, 1998): at
   <a href="http://www.vatican.va/roman\_curia/pontifical\_councils/chrstuni/documents/rc\_pc\_chrstuni-documents/rc\_

11/4/10: Roman Catholicism, the Original Covenant, Zionism, and Recognition of the State of Israel.

- BXVI, Communio, re: Catholicism and the Old Covenant.
- Recognition of Israel/diplomatic relations. Weigel, *Witness to Hope*, 446-49, 491-93, 537-543, and 697-713.

- Letter to the Hebrews,?
- Araujo and Lucal, ??

11/9/10: Roman Catholicism, Christian Democracy, and the European Union.

- Gabriel Almond, "The Christian Parties of Western Europe," World Politics, Vol. 1, No. 1
  (1948): 30-58 at: https://www.cambridge.org/core/services/aop-cambridgecore/content/view/0B2AD0D6649A5D783187DF767838EC4A/S0043887100014982a.pdf/chr
  istian\_parties\_of\_western\_europe.pdf
- Joan Keating, "Looking to Europe: Roman Catholics and Christian Democracy in 1930s Britain," *European History*, Vol. 26 (1996): 57-79 at: <a href="https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/026569149602600104">https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/026569149602600104</a>.
- Araujo and Lucal, ??

## Second Memorandum Assigned, Due 11/16/10 at 5:00 PM (e.s.t.) Via Concourse.

11/11/10: Vatican II and the "Completely Fresh Appraisal of War."

- John XXIII, Pacem in Terris: Encyclical on Establishing Universal Peace in Truth, Justice, Charity, and Liberty (April 11, 1963), Secs. 1-45 and 80-172 at http://www.vatican.va/holy\_father/john\_xxiii/encyclicals/documents/hf\_j-xxiii\_enc\_11041963\_pacem\_en.html
- Paul VI, Gaudium Et Spes: Pastoral Constitution of the Church in the Modern World (December 7, 1965), Secs.1-10, 23-45, and 77-93 at http://www.vatican.va/archive/hist\_councils/ii\_vatican\_council/documents/vat-ii\_cons\_19651207\_gaudium-et-spes\_en.html
- Vidmar, 334-340.

11/16/10: The Theology of Liberation (*Romero*).

- Gustavo Gutiérrez, "Toward a New Method: Theology and Liberation" in *Gustavo Gutiérrez:* Essential Writings, James B. Nickoloff, ed. and intro. (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 2000), 23-77.@
- Weigel, Witness to Hope, 281-87, 437-39, 451-59, and 522-23.

11/18/10: The U.S. Catholic Bishops and the Bomb.

- The Challenge of Peace, Summary and paras. 122-339
- Alain C. Enthoven, "Reason, Morality, and Defense Policy" in Harold P. Ford and Francis X. Winters, S.J., eds., *Ethics and Nuclear Strategy* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, ?), 218-33.@
- Weigel, Witness to Hope, 464-66.
- Central Committee of German Catholics, "Military Balance is Essential to Peace," in Ernest
   W. Lefever and E. Stephen Hunt, eds., *The Apocalyptic Premise: Nuclear Arms Debated* (Washington, DC: Ethics and Public Policy Center, 1982), 323-30.@
- John Paul II, "Deterrence is Morally Acceptable" in Lefever and Hunt, 331-39.@

- Michael C. Desch, "No More Nukes: An Exchange," *Commonweal*, February 9, 2018 at: https://www.commonwealmagazine.org/no-more-nukes [with Gerald Powers].

11/24/10: John Paul II and the End of the Cold War.

Weigel, *Witness to Hope*, 278-81, 291-325, 396-419, 430-34, 440-42, 459-64, 475-80, 500-02, 543-48, 568-76, 585-88, and 598-612.

## Thanksgiving, No Class 11/26/10

11/30/10: The Catholic Vision of War and Peace in the Post-Cold War World.

- Gulf War, I, Weigel, Witness to Hope, 619-24.
- Balkans, Weigel, Witness to Hope, 665-66.
- Democracy/Human Rights, 343-55, 530-37, 774-780, 805-814.

12/2/10: Catholicism and the War on Terror. (James Olson visit).

- George Weigel, "Moral Clarity in a Time of War," First Things, 128 (January 2003): 20-27.
- James Olson, *Fair Play: The Moral dimensions of Spying* (Washington, DC: Potomac Books, 2007), 1-43 and Scenarios 1, 4, 5,6, 10, 13, 19, 20, 21, 26, 42, 48, and 50.@
- MaryEllen O'Connell, "Flying Blind: U.S. Combat Drones Operate Outside International Law,"
   America (March 15, 2010) at
   http://www.americamagazine.org/content/article.cfm?article\_id=12179
- Mark Oppenheimer, "Catholic Defender of Waterboarding Gets an Earful From Critics," New York Times, February 27, 2010, p. A15 at <a href="http://www.nytimes.com/2010/02/27/us/27beliefs.html?scp=1&sq=catholic%20defender%20of%20waterboarding&st=cse">http://www.nytimes.com/2010/02/27/us/27beliefs.html?scp=1&sq=catholic%20defender%20of%20waterboarding&st=cse</a>.

12/7/10: Roman Catholicism, the Market, Global Capitalism, and the Environment.

- JPII or BXVI on globalization?
- Laudato Si.

12/9/10: Can There Be An Ethic of Catholic Realism?

- John Courtney Murray, S.J., "Remarks on the Moral Problem of War," *Theological Studies* Vol. 20, No. ? (1959): 40-61.\*
- ROP piece vs. Machiavellianism ...
- Michael C. Desch, "It Is Kind to Be Cruel: The Humanity of American Realism," *Review of International Studies* Vol. 29, No. 4 (Summer 2003): 415-26.\*
- Mark Edwards, "'God Has Chosen Us'": Re-Membering Christian Realism, Rescuing Christendom, and the Contest of Responsibilities during the Cold War," *Diplomatic History*, Volume 33, Issue 1 (1 January 2009): 67–94.
- Niebuhr chapter ...

Final Paper Due 12/13/10 at 5:00 PM (e.s.t.) Via Concourse.