

History 30554: Catholicism Confronts Modernity

Professor Sarah Shortall

Email: sarah.shortall@nd.edu

Office Hours: Wednesdays and Fridays, 11am-noon, and by appointment

Office:

Course Description

This class introduces students to the history of Catholicism since the French Revolution, with a primary focus on modern Europe. It examines how Catholics confronted the challenges of modernity—from liberal democracy and nationalism; to capitalism and modern science; to new political ideologies such as fascism and communism. We will examine not only how these encounters transformed the Church, but also how Catholicism itself has shaped modern European politics and culture. The first part of the course begins with the nineteenth-century “culture wars” between Catholics and anticlerical forces, focusing in particular on popular devotions like the Lourdes pilgrimage and the perceived “feminization” of religion. The second part of the course shifts to the twentieth century and examines the relationship between the Catholic Church and modern political ideologies such as nationalism, fascism, communism, and democracy. The third part of the course explores modern Catholic art, literature, and film. Finally, we close by examining the more recent history of Catholicism since the transformative changes of the Second Vatican Council in the 1960s. Readings are drawn from a range of primary sources—including novels, speeches, Church documents, works of art, and films—as well as secondary sources by historians.

Learning Goals

This course meets the learning goals for the Catholicism and the Disciplines component of the Core Curriculum, which requires that courses be based in a particular **discipline** and invite students to **engage** critically and constructively with the **Catholic** tradition. Upon successful completion of this course, you will be able to:

- Identify the key themes and events that have shaped the modern history of European Catholicism (Catholic).
- Distill and evaluate arguments by other historians (Discipline).
- Interpret and analyze a variety of primary sources by or about Catholics, by situating them in their historical context (Discipline).
- Engage critically and constructively with the normative and faith questions raised by Catholicism’s confrontation with modernity, as Catholics grappled with the challenge posed by secular political ideologies, modern science, secularization, and capitalism, among other things. How can the Church adapt to these modern developments without betraying its traditions? Which aspects of Catholic faith and doctrine are subject to historical change and which must remain unchanging? What role should the Church play in domestic and international politics in a secular world? Does it have a responsibility to condemn dangerous political ideologies or is this a violation of its spiritual mission? In the final exam and the debate in week 7, students are asked to defend a position on one of these questions using the sources they have read (Engagement).

The course also meets the learning goals for the History component of the Core Curriculum, which are based on five criteria: **temporal**, **contextual**, **analytical**, **literate**, and **respectful**. Upon successful completion of this course, you will be able to:

- Identify the key themes and events that have shaped the modern history of European Catholicism (Temporal).
- Interpret and analyze a variety of primary sources by placing them in their historical context (Contextual, Analytical).
- Communicate your insights clearly and respectfully in the classroom discussion, as well as listening and responding thoughtfully to the contributions of your classmates (Literate).
- Formulate your insights in effective writing, by learning how to make a clear argument and support it using appropriate historical evidence (Literate).
- Evaluate how Catholicism has changed over time and the way the history of modern Europe has shaped the contemporary Church (Respectful).

Course Requirements

- **Essay 1 (15%):** 4-5 page essay based on the course readings, which must incorporate both primary and secondary sources. The essay prompt that will be handed out in week 4.
- **Essay 2 (15%):** Primary-source analysis based on a document of the student's choice. Students are encouraged to draw upon the unique resources available at Notre Dame, such as the Snite Museum, the University archives, or the library's special collections.
- **Essay 3 (20%):** Essay on a Catholic work of art or literature, situating it in its historical context and in relation to the Catholic tradition. Students will be asked to consider what makes something a "Catholic" work of art or literature, how such works relate to official Catholic teaching, and what they can tell us about the history of Catholicism.
- **Take-home exam (25%):** Students will be asked to use the knowledge they have gained about the history of Catholic teaching to evaluate how the Church handled one of the challenges raised by the modern world (e.g. capitalism, fascism, empire, the Holocaust, etc.), judging it in relation to both Catholic teaching and the demands of the historical moment.
- **Participation (25%):** Active, thoughtful, and regular participation is a central component of this course. Your participation will be evaluated based on the rubric below and I will provide you with mid-semester feedback on your participation in order to help you improve. As part of your participation grade, you are required to prepare two discussion questions on the readings for each class or select two passages from the text you would like to discuss in class. Your contribution to the **debate on Pius XII and the Holocaust in week 7** will also be factored into your participation grade.

Course Policies

Office Hours: My office hours are Wednesdays and Fridays from 11 am to noon. If my regular office hours conflict with your class schedule, please email me and we can set up an alternative time to meet. I'm always eager to speak with students, so please don't hesitate to meet with me in office hours for any reason.

Email: I will use email to send out course announcements, essay prompts, and other information. Please be sure to you check your Notre Dame email account once each day. Likewise, I will be sure to respond to emails within 24 hours (48 hours on weekends). I much prefer to discuss assignments and weightier matters in person, so if you would like assistance with an assignment or to discuss lingering questions, please come to my office hours.

Accommodations: If you have, or think you may have, a disability, please contact Sara Bea Disability Services so that we may discern how accommodations can best be implemented in this course. Additional information about Sara Bea Disability Services and the process for requesting accommodations can be found at sarabeadisabilityservices.nd.edu.

Laptops and Tablets: Students should not have their laptops, tablets, or cell phones out during class. These devices interfere with engagement in the collective discussion and, as a growing body of research indicates, diminish your ability to learn and retain material. This means that you will need to print hard copies of all reading assignments, which we will use to enhance our discussion in class. At 2 cents per (double-side) page amount to far less than purchasing even one additional book. I provide most of the readings via Sakai rather than through a Course Packet in order to keep costs as low as possible.

Late Policy: Assignments will be marked down by a third of a letter grade for every day that they are late (e.g. B+ to B). Let me know about potential conflicts with due dates as soon as possible. I will grant extensions on a case-by-case basis, but I do not grant extensions requested less than 24 hours before the deadline.

Honor Code: Notre Dame students are expected to abide by Academic Code of Honor Pledge. "As a member of the Notre Dame community, I will not participate in or tolerate academic dishonesty." All students are expected to familiarize themselves with the Honor Code on the University's website (<http://honorcode.nd.edu>) and pledge to observe its provisions in all written and oral work. This means that all graded work for this class must be your own and you must clearly acknowledge the sources you have used in any written work. Any incidence of plagiarism or other academic dishonesty will be reported to the Associate Provost. For a reminder of what constitutes plagiarism, see the library's website: <http://libguides.library.nd.edu/scholarlypublishing/plagiarism>.

Books

Suzanne Kaufman, *Consuming Visions: Mass Culture and the Lourdes Shrine* (Cornell University Press): ISBN: 978-0801475325

David Kertzer, *The Pope and Mussolini: The Secret History of Pius XI and the Rise of Fascism in Europe* (Random House): ISBN: 081298367X

Graham Greene, *The Power and the Glory* (Penguin): ISBN: 9780143107552

David Lodge, *Souls and Bodies* (Penguin): ISBN: 978-0140130187

Reading Schedule

(Subject to modification)

Part 1: The Culture Wars

Week 1: Introduction

Tuesday: When did Catholicism become modern?

Thursday: The French Revolution and The Feminization of Religion

- Caroline Ford, *Divided Houses: Religion and Gender in Modern France* (2005): pp. 17-36
- **Primary Source:** “Festival of the Supreme Being” (1794)
- **Optional Background:** Gemma Betros, “The French Revolution and the Catholic Church”: <http://www.historytoday.com/gemma-betros/french-revolution-and-catholic-church>

Further Reading:

- Christopher Clark and Wolfram Kaiser, *Culture Wars: Catholic-Secular Conflicts in Nineteenth-Century Europe* (2003): chapters 1 and 3.
- Robert Gildea, *The Past in French History* (1994): “Catholicism”

Week 2: Anticlericalism

Tuesday: The Risorgimento

- Manuel Borutta, “Anti-Catholicism and the Culture Wars in Risorgimento Italy,” in *The Risorgimento Revisited: Nationalism and Culture in Nineteenth-Century Italy* (2012), pp. 191-213.
- **In Class:** Anticlerical cartoons

Thursday: The Kulturkampf

- **Primary Source:** Pius IX, *The Syllabus of Errors* (1864): <http://www.papalencyclicals.net/pius09/p9syll.htm>
- David Blackbourn, “Progress and Piety: Liberalism, Catholicism and the State in Imperial Germany,” *History Workshop Journal* (1988), pp. 57-78.

Further Reading:

David Kertzer, *The Kidnapping of Edgardo Mortara* (1997)

Christopher Clark and Wolfram Kaiser, *Culture Wars: Catholic-Secular Conflicts in Nineteenth-Century Europe* (2003): chapters 2, 8, and 9.

Week 3: Lourdes

Tuesday: Capitalism and the Lourdes Shrine

- Suzanne Kaufman, *Consuming Visions: Mass Culture and the Lourdes Shrine* (2005): introduction, chapter 1- 2.

Thursday: Modern Science and the Cures

- Ruth Harris, *Lourdes: Body and Soul in a Secular Age*: “Science and Religion under the Third Republic”
- Robert Orsi, “Abundant History: Marian Apparitions as Alternative Modernity,” *Historically Speaking* (September/October 2006): pp. 12-16.

Further Reading:

- Alison Frank, “The Pleasant and the Useful: Pilgrimage and Tourism in Habsburg Mariazell,” *Austrian History Yearbook* 40 (2009): pp. 157-182.
- Caroline Ford, “Religion and Popular Culture in Modern Europe,” *Journal of Modern History* 65 (1993): 152-175.
- David Blackbourn, *Marpingen: Apparitions of the Virgin Mary in Nineteenth-Century Germany* (1993)
- Sergio Luzzatto, *Padre Pio: Miracles and Politics in a Secular Age* (2007)
- Raymond Jonas, *France and the Cult of the Sacred Heart* (2000)

Week 4: Empire

Tuesday: Early-modern exploration

- **In Class: visit to the Columbus murals**
- Film: *Silence* (Martin Scorsese)

Thursday: Missionaries

- John McGreevy, *American Jesuits and the World: How an Embattled Religious Order Made Modern Catholicism Global* (2016): selections.
- J.P. Daughton, *An Empire Divided: Religion, Republicanism, and the Making of French Colonialism* (2008): selections.

Part 2: Catholic Politics

Week 5: Catholicism and Nationalism

Tuesday: “Polak-Katolik”

- Brian Porter-Szücs, *Faith and Fatherland: Catholicism, Modernity, and Poland* (2011): pp. 328-359.
- **In Class: “Polish Catholic Populist Party Platform”** (1927); “Circular Letter by Cardinal Hlond” (1936)

Thursday: Cold-War Poland

- Genevieve Zubrzycki, *The Crosses of Auschwitz: Nationalism and Religion in Post-Communist Poland* (2006): chapter 1.
- **Primary Source:** John Paul II, “Victory Square Homily” (1979): http://w2.vatican.va/content/john-paul-ii/en/homilies/1979/documents/hf_jp-ii_hom_19790602_polonia-varsavia.html
- **Film:** *Ida* (Pawel Pawlikowski)

Further Reading:

- Neal Pease, *Rome’s Most Faithful Daughter (1914-1939)* (2009).
- Paul Hanebrink, “Christianity, Nation, State: The Case of Christian Hungary,” *Christianity and Modernity in Eastern Europe*, ed. Bruce Berglund and Brian Porter-Szücs (2010): pp. 61-84.

Week 6: Catholicism and Fascism

Tuesday: Lateran Accords

Essay 1 due

- **Primary Source:** Pius XI and Mussolini speeches at the Lateran Agreements (1929)

Thursday: The Church and Fascism

- David Kertzer, *The Pope and Mussolini: The Secret History of Pius XI and the Rise of Fascism in Europe* (2014): prologue, chapters 8, 9, 12, 14, 15, 23, and 24.

Further Reading:

- John Connelly, *From Enemy to Brother: The Revolution in Catholic Teaching on the Jews, 1933-1965* (2012): pp. 65-93.
- Hubert Wolf, *Pope and Devil: The Vatican’s Archives and the Third Reich* (2010)
- Susannah Heschel, *The Aryan Jesus: Christian Theologians and the Bible in Nazi Germany* (2010)

Week 7: Catholicism and the Second World War

Tuesday: Pius XII and the Holocaust

- Michael Phayer, *The Catholic Church and the Holocaust, 1930-1965* (2000): chapter 4.

Thursday: Pius XII and the Holocaust

- Robert Ventresca, *Soldier of Christ: The Life of Pope Pius XII* (2013): chapter 5.
- **In Class: Debate on Pius XII and the Holocaust**

Further Reading:

- José Sanchez, *Pius XII and the Holocaust: Understanding the Controversy* (2002)
- Michael Phayer, *Pius XII, the Holocaust and the Cold War* (2007)
- Frank Coppa, *The Papacy, the Jews, and the Holocaust* (2006): chapter 6.
- John Cornwell, *Hitler’s Pope: The Secret History of Pius XII* (1999)
- Susan Zuccotti, *Under His Very Windows: The Vatican and the Holocaust in Italy* (2000)
- Paul Hanebrink, *In Defense of Christian Hungary: Religion, Nationalism, and Antisemitism, 1890-1944* (2006): pp. 170-180.

Week 8: Catholicism and Democracy

Tuesday: Jacques Maritain

- **Primary Source:** Jacques Maritain, *Christianity and Democracy* (1942): pp. 9-46.
- **In Class:** selection from Jacques Maritain, *Man and the State* (1953).

Thursday: Christian Democracy

- Jan-Werner Müller, *Contesting Democracy: Political Ideas in Twentieth-Century Europe* (2011): pp. 132-43.
- **In Class:** Konrad Adenauer, “Christian Civilization at Stake” (1955)

Further Reading:

- Jan-Werner Müller, “Towards a new History of Christian Democracy”
- James Chappel, *Catholic Modern: The Challenge of Totalitarianism and the Remaking of the Church* (2018): chapters 4 and 5.
- Maria Mitchell, *The Origins of Christian Democracy: Politics and Confession in Modern Germany* (2012)
- Wolfram Kaiser, *Christian Democracy and the Origins of the European Union* (2007)
- Marco Duranti, *The Conservative Human Rights Revolution* (2017)
- Piotr Kosicki, ed., *Christian Democracy across the Iron Curtain: Europe Redefined* (forthcoming)

Week 9: Catholicism and Communism

Tuesday: Interwar Anti-Communism

- Giuliana Chamedes, “The Vatican, Nazi-Fascism, and the Making of Transnational Anti-Communism in the 1930s,” *Journal of Contemporary History* 51, no. 2 (2016): pp. 261-290.
- **In Class:** Pius XI, *Divini Redemptoris* (1937): sections 2, 3, 9, 10, 11, 13, 14.

Thursday: The Cold War

- Robert Ventresca, *Soldier of Christ: The Life of Pope Pius XII* (2013): pp. 241-253.
- **Primary Source:** Giovanni Guareschi, *The Little World of Don Camillo*: pp. 1-29, 46-59, 138-47.

Part 3: Catholic Art and Culture

Week 10: Joan of Arc

Tuesday: Joan of Arc in Politics

Essay 2 due

- Eric Jennings, “Reinventing Jeanne: The Iconology of Joan of Arc in Vichy Schoolbooks, 1940-1944,” *Journal of Contemporary History* 29 (October 1994): pp. 711-34.

Thursday: Joan of Arc in Art

- **Film:** *The Passion of Joan of Arc* (Carl Theodor Dreyer)
- **In Class: Visit to Snite Museum to view Joan of Arc works**

Further Reading:

- Gerd Krumeich, “Joan of Arc between Right and Left,” in *Nationhood and Nationalism in France from Boulangism to the Great War, 1889-1918* (HarperCollins, 1991): pp. 63-73.
- Venita Datta, “On the Boulevards: Representations of Joan of Arc in Popular Theater,” in *Heroines and Legends of Fin-de-Siècle France* (Cambridge University Press, 2011): pp. 142-78.
- Timothy Wilson-Smith, *Joan of Arc: Maid, Myth, and History* (Sutton, 2006): pp. 185-212.
- **Primary Source:** Georges Bernanos, *Joan, Heretic or Saint* (1934)
- **Primary Source:** Bertolt Brecht, *Saint Joan of the Stockyards* (1932)
- **Primary Source:** George Bernard Shaw, *Saint Joan* (1924)

Week 11: Catholic Literature

Tuesday:

- G.K. Chesterton, *Father Brown Stories*: “The Hammer of God”

Thursday:

- Graham Greene, *The Power and the Glory* (1940)

Further Reading:

- Evelyn Waugh, *Brideshead Revisited* (1945)
- Mark Bosco, “From the *Power and the Glory* to the *Honorary Consul*: The Development of Graham Greene’s Catholic Imagination,” *Religion and Literature* (summer 2004)

Week 12: Catholic Art and Film

Tuesday: Catholic Modernism in Film

- **Film:** *Diary of a Country Priest* (1951, Robert Bresson)
- **Film:** *Rome, Open City* (1945, Roberto Rossellini)

Thursday: Catholic Modernism in Art

- **In Class: Visit to Snite Museum**
- **Homework:** Find a Mestrovic sculpture on campus (I will send out a map) and write up a paragraph on how the style of the artwork expresses Catholic themes.

Part 4: The Church Since the 1960s

Week 13: Vatican II

Tuesday: Vatican II

- **Primary Source:** Documents of the Second Vatican Council (1962-1965):
http://www.vatican.va/archive/hist_councils/ii_vatican_council/index.htm
 - *Gaudium et Spes* (1965), sections 1-4, 41, 76, 91-3
 - *Nostra Aetate* (1965), section 4
 - *Dignitatis Humanae* (1965), sections 1-4

- John O'Malley, *What Happened at Vatican II* (2008): pp. 1-14.

Thursday: Liberation Theology

- Gustavo Gutiérrez, *Cambridge Companion to Liberation Theology*: introduction
- Jean-Marc Ela, *African Cry*: chapter 1.

Week 14: The 1960s

Tuesday:

- David Lodge, *Souls and Bodies* (1980): chapters 1-5.

Thursday, November 29th:

- David Lodge, *Souls and Bodies* (1980): chapters 6-7.

Week 15: The Future of Catholicism

Tuesday: Sex Abuse Scandal

Essay 3 due

- TBD

Thursday: Technology

- TBD

****Take-home exam due****